

ATS with His divine blessings and that whatever is done will be done to the glory of God and our Lord Jesus Christ.

Sincerely yours,

Gerhard F. Hasel

Journal of the Adventist Theological Society, 3/1 (1992):7-21.

Article copyright © 1992 by Richard M. Davidson.

SALVATION AND FORGIVENESS

By Richard M. Davidson

Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary

Andrews University

Introduction

Today is Easter Friday (April 17, 1992). It is also one of those rare occasions when Easter Friday in our Gregorian calendar coincides with the eve of Passover, the 14th day of Nisan in the Hebrew calendar. On this day, almost 2,000 years ago, in fact, at this very time of day (about the 9th hour, 3 p.m.), Jesus, hanging upon Golgotha's cross, cried out, "It is finished! Father, into your hands I commit my spirit." At this time, on this day, in A.D. 31, the antitypical Paschal lamb died.

The evening before, on Maundy Thursday, in the upper room, Jesus explained in advance the meaning of His death. "And he took a cup, and when he had given thanks he gave it to them, saying, 'Drink of it, all of you; for this is my blood of the [new] covenant, which is poured out for many for the forgiveness of sins'" (Matt 26:27).

When the blood flowed from the Saviour's riven side, the new covenant was formally ratified. And the essence of the new covenant promise, according to Jesus (alluding to Jeremiah 31), is the forgiveness of sins.¹ Salvation and forgiveness is at the heart of what happened at the Cross.

English Terminology. When we speak of forgiveness, we could just as well be using any of several virtually-synonymous biblical terms: forgiveness, pardon, remission, or justification² (or closely related terms: reconciliation, covering, atonement, and propitiation). In an intriguing reference, E. G. White uses the three

main terms “pardon,” “justification,” and “forgiveness” synonymously: “*Pardon* and *justification* are one and the same thing. . . . The sinner receives the *forgiveness* of his sins, because these sins are borne by his Substitute and Surety.”³

Hebrew Terminology. A variety of Hebrew and Greek terms are employed to portray the concept of forgiveness.⁴ In Hebrew, the five main words for “forgive” include: (1) *nāsā*⁷ to “lift up, take away”—“forgiveness in terms of guilt being taken away, atoned for, or borne, resulting in divine pardon”⁵ (Exod 28:43; 32:32; Lev 5:1, 7; Num 14:19, 34; 18:1; Josh 24:19; Ps 85:3; etc.); (2) *sālah* “forgive, pardon” (and derivatives, *sallāh* “ready to forgive,” *s^eliḥāh* “forgiveness”), always referring to God’s forgiveness of man (Num 30:5, 8, 12; 1 Kgs 8:30, 34, 36, 39, 50; 2 Kgs 24:4; Amos 7:2; Ps 86:5; 130:4; Dan 9:9; Neh 12:7, 20; etc.); (3) *māḥah* “wipe away” (Ps 51:1, 7; Isa 43:25; 44:22; etc.); (4) *kāsāh* “cover” (Neh 4:5; Ps 32:1; 85:2; etc.); and (5) *kippēr* “to atone” (Deut 21:8; Ps 78:38; Jer 18:23; etc.).

Greek Terminology. In the LXX Greek terms expressing forgiveness include the verbs *euilateuō* “show mercy” (used for translating both *nāsā*⁷ and *sālah*), and *epikalýptō*, *kalýptō*, and *krýptō* “cover, conceal” (used for *kāsāh*). Sometimes *sālah* is translated as *hileōs*, and *māḥah* is rendered by *exaleíphō* “wipe away.”

In the New Testament the concept of forgiveness is portrayed by five verbs: *apolyō* (e.g., Luke 6:37), *aphiēmi* (e.g., Matt 6:12ff, 1 John 1:9), *charizomai* (2 Cor 2:7, 10), *kalýptō* (1 Pet 4:8), and *epikalýptō* (Rom 4:7); and by two nouns: *áphesis* (Mark 3:39; Acts 5:31) “putting away, remission, forgiveness” and *páresis* (Rom 3:25) “passing over.”

From an examination of the various terms for forgiveness and their usages in the Scriptures, four major facets of forgiveness emerge. Each of these facets is illustrated in the original Passover service, which was the foreshadowing of Jesus’ antitypical Paschal sacrifice for the remission of our sins. On this Easter Friday, the eve of Jewish Passover, it is particularly appropriate to refer to this typological illustration of our topic.

This will not be a technical, exegetical study. Rather in this presentation I invite you to rejoice in the great biblical statements on forgiveness. I also will call attention to that profound modern theologian of forgiveness, who gives inspired insights into the

biblical data—Ellen G. White. Time and again I have thought I discovered some new glorious insight in the Greek or Hebrew of Scripture, then going back to E. G. White, only to find that she had the insight already! In this study I cannot resist providing the opportunity to bask in some of the beauty and force of her expressions regarding forgiveness.

The Basis of Forgiveness

The Blood of Christ (Substitutionary Atonement)

The first facet of forgiveness focuses on its foundation. What is the *basis* of forgiveness in Scripture?

Passover Deliverance Typology. When we think back to the first Passover, the time of Israel’s deliverance from their bondage in Egypt, and a type of spiritual Israel’s deliverance from the bondage to sin, what was the basis of their deliverance? Scripture is clear: the basis was the *blood of the Lamb*! The Lord said to Israel that first Passover eve: “The blood [of the Passover lamb] shall be a sign for you, upon the houses where you are; and when I see the blood, I will pass over you, and no plague shall fall upon you to destroy you, when I smite the land of Egypt” (Exod 12:13).

As E. G. White put it, “When the first-born in Egypt perished, that of Israel, though graciously preserved, had been justly exposed to the same doom but for the atoning sacrifice.”⁶

Antotypically, the basis for forgiveness is the blood of the substitutionary sacrifice. Paul writes, “Christ our passover is sacrificed for us” (1 Cor 5:7, KJV). “The sacrificial lamb represents ‘the Lamb of God,’ in whom is our only hope of salvation.”⁷

Sanctuary: Forgiveness by Substitute Sacrifice. What is implicit in the Passover typology is explicit in the Old Testament sanctuary ritual for forgiveness of sin. In Leviticus 4-6, where specific directions are given for the sin and guilt offerings, the basic pattern is always the same. The sinner brings the sin or guilt offering, lays his hands upon the innocent victim, transferring his sins in figure to the sacrifice; then the animal is slain, and the blood manipulated by the priest to make atonement for the sinner. Eight times this procedure is repeated in these chapters, in connection with various circumstances and parties involved. Each time, right after the blood is applied for atonement, there comes the priestly

pronouncement: "He is forgiven."⁸ Forgiveness is based upon the blood of the Substitute that dies in the sinner's place.

Hebrews 9:22 states incisively: "Without the shedding of blood there is no forgiveness [*áphesis*] of sins." Or as Paul writes to the Ephesians: "In him [Jesus] we have redemption through his blood, the forgiveness [*áphesis*] of our trespasses" (1:7).

As we ponder the meaning of the blood in the Passover and the other sacrifices of the sanctuary services, we perceive that the blood was not presented primarily with the purpose of winning over the hearts of sinners. The sinner no doubt was moved by the ceremony of sacrifice, but in Scripture it was the sinner, already repentant, who presented the sacrifice as a substitute, to typify the Lamb of God who would die in his place. Angel Rodriguez's published dissertation⁹ demonstrates the fundamental substitutionary meaning of Passover and the other sanctuary-related sacrifices.

E. G. White describes how "Christ, in counsel with His Father, instituted the system of sacrificial offerings; that death, instead of being immediately visited upon the transgressor, should be transferred to a victim which should prefigure the great and perfect offering of the Son of God."¹⁰

Retributive Justice: A Scriptural Teaching. The concept of substitution as the basis for forgiveness is not just Christ as Substitute from *our* perspective, but from *God's* perspective.¹¹ It involves the biblical truth of retributive justice, that is clearly portrayed throughout Scripture. The law of *lex talionis* (legal, just retribution) is unwaveringly presented in the Torah,¹² Prophets,¹³ and Writings¹⁴ of the Old Testament, in the New Testament Gospels,¹⁵ Epistles,¹⁶ and most clearly of all in the Apocalypse.¹⁷ Contrary to the claim of some,¹⁸ it was *not* repudiated on the legal level by Jesus in Matthew 5:38-40. What Christ opposed was private vengeance, in harmony with the Old Testament statements to the same effect: Proverbs 24:29 and 20:22.¹⁹

E. G. White forcefully indicates the truth of retributive justice at the cross: "The power that inflicted retributive justice upon man's substitute and surety, was the power that sustained and upheld the suffering One under the tremendous weight of wrath that would have fallen upon a sinful world. Christ was suffering

the death that was pronounced upon the transgressors of God's law."²⁰

One cannot contrast (and put in opposition) the way of punishment (which is said to be "primitive" and "pagan") and the way of forgiveness (which is said to be "God's way"), as some have done.²¹ Rather, in Scripture forgiveness is possible *because* of the punishment of sin in the person of our Substitute. E. G. White boldly states: "Our sins were laid on Christ, punished in Christ, put away by Christ, in order that His righteousness might be imputed to us."²²

In describing the basis of forgiveness in the blood of Christ, we must be careful to uphold both the mercy and justice of God. We note, e.g., Rom 3:25-26 (NKJV): "[Jesus Christ] whom God set forth to be a propitiation by His blood, through faith, to demonstrate His righteousness, because in His forbearance God had passed over the sins that were previously committed, to demonstrate at the present time His righteousness, that He might be just and the justifier of the one who has faith in Jesus." Note also Ps 85:10 (NKJV): "Mercy and truth have met together; righteousness and peace have kissed each other."

E. G. White is so clear:

God is approached through Jesus Christ, the Mediator; the only way through which He forgives sins. God cannot forgive sins at the expense of His justice, His holiness, and His truth. But He does forgive sins and that fully. There are no sins He will not forgive in and through the Lord Jesus Christ. This is the sinner's only hope, and if he rests here in sincere faith, he is sure of pardon and that full and free.²³

It is not enough to say that on the cross Jesus simply was experiencing the natural consequences of sin to show man that the wages of sin is death—to win us back to faith.²⁴ It is not enough to see the moral drawing power of the Cross; we must also see Christ's death as satisfying divine justice. E. G. White writes: "Christ on the cross not only draws men to repentance toward God for the transgression of His law—for whom God pardons He first makes penitent—but Christ has satisfied Justice; He has proffered Himself as an atonement. His gushing blood, His broken body satisfy the claims of the broken law, and thus He bridges the gulf which sin has made."²⁵

Again: "The sinner receives the forgiveness of his sins, because these sins are borne by his Substitute and Surety. . . . It is the Father's prerogative to forgive our transgressions and sins, because Christ has taken upon Himself the guilt and reprieved us, imputing to us His own righteousness. His sacrifice satisfies fully the demands of justice."²⁶ And we cannot omit that potent line in *Desire of Ages*: "He, the sinbearer, endures the wrath of Divine justice, and for thy sake becomes sin itself."²⁷

God could not merely declare man forgiven by His free creative power, as some have suggested.²⁸ This is because both justice and mercy are required, as part of the very character of God.

As E. G. White put it: "Justice demands that sin be not merely pardoned, but the death penalty must be executed. God, in the gift of His only begotten Son, met both these requirements. By dying in man's stead, Christ exhausted the penalty and provided a pardon."²⁹

The Nature of Divine Forgiveness. God's forgiveness is not exactly like human forgiveness. Note what E. G. White wrote in a letter to Uriah Smith, in 1886:

Men may say, 'I forgive all the injuries you have done to me,' but their forgiveness would not blot out one sin. But the Voice sounding from Calvary—'My son, my daughter, thy sins be forgiven thee'—is all-efficacious. . . . Many have expressed wonder that God demanded so many slain victims in sacrificial offerings of the Jews, but it was to rivet in their minds the great and solemn truth that without shedding of blood there was no remission of sins.³⁰

Some seem to build their whole structure of forgiveness on the parable of the prodigal son, but R. K. Harrison³¹ has insightfully pointed to the inadequacy of this approach:

The parable of the Prodigal Son was spoken to teach the freedom of God's forgiveness and acceptance of returning sinners, and the duty of men to assume the same attitude toward them. This much it teaches, but it fails to set forth entirely God's attitude toward sin. With reference to the sinner God is love and mercy, but with reference to sin He is righteous, and this element of God's nature is no less essential to Him than His love, and must be considered in any effort to set forth completely the doctrine of God's forgiveness of sinners.

We cannot remove the doctrine of the penal substitution of

Christ, the propitiatory work of Christ on the cross which satisfies divine retributive justice. This doctrine is at the heart of the sanctuary message; it is clear throughout Old Testament and New Testament theology. It is the consistent view of Ellen White, throughout her life.³² The atonement does also draw people to Christ, does also lead to healing, as we will see, but the objective basis for forgiveness must always be Christ's penal, forensic, substitutionary work.

If one does not acknowledge that forgiveness is based upon the penal substitutionary death of Christ, upon His satisfying the penalty of divine retributive justice in our place, *then there is a distortion of the gospel at its very core*. In the very attempt to uphold the gracious character of God, such a view results in emasculating God's justice and holiness. In fact, it also emasculates His mercy as well. E. G. White writes:

His [Christ's] object was to reconcile the prerogatives of justice and mercy, and let each stand separate in its dignity, yet united. His mercy was not weakness, but a terrible power to punish sin because it is sin; yet a power to draw to it the love of humanity. Through Christ Justice is enabled to forgive without sacrificing one jot of its exalted holiness.³³

How Is Substitution Possible? But some have raised the question, "How is one person able to take the penalty for another's sins? Is this not confusing the laws of civil and criminal justice?"³⁴ How was it possible for Christ to become our substitute?

I believe the answer is to be found in at least two crucial biblical concepts. First, Christ is our *Creator*. That means that we are not only His sons, but also his "workmanship" (Eph 2:10), His *property*. We *belong* to Him, and thus it is perfectly appropriate for Him to substitute a payment equivalent to (or in reality far exceeding)³⁵ the value of His property.

Second, Christ is the representative man, the second Adam. Just as Levi paid tithes to Melchizedek because by corporate solidarity he was in the loins of Abraham (Heb 7:9), so the whole world was corporately in Christ on the Cross. As Paul put it: "We are convinced that one has died for all; therefore all have died" (2 Cor 5:14). We all died in Christ on Golgotha. Thus the guilt of the whole world was atoned for by the death of that one Representative Man.

So, according to Romans 5:10: "While we were enemies we were reconciled to God by the death of his Son." "The Lord laid on him the iniquity of us all" (Isa 53:6).

As E. G. White puts it: "The sins of a guilty world, which in figure are represented as 'red as crimson,' were imputed to the divine Surety."³⁶

Thus Jesus paid an infinite price sufficient to atone for the guilt of the world. Does that mean that there is nothing left for the sinner to do? In one sense, yes, the whole world has already been reconciled to God. But this leads us to the second facet of forgiveness in Scripture.

The Path of Forgiveness: Man's Part

On this Easter Friday, the eve of Passover, we go back in our minds to the first Passover. The book *Patriarchs and Prophets* paints the Passover scene and focuses the issue sharply:

It was not enough that the paschal lamb be slain; its blood must be sprinkled upon the doorposts; so the merits of Christ's blood must be applied to the soul. We must believe, not only that he died for the world, but that he died for us individually. *We must appropriate to ourselves the virtue of the atoning sacrifice.*³⁷

The typology of the sacrifices for sin at the sanctuary presents the same truth. Before the individual sinner received the priestly declaration, "He is forgiven," he placed his hands upon the head of the innocent animal, and in repentance confessed his sins.³⁸

There are some who suggest that since Christ died for the sins of the whole world, and reconciled the world to Himself, we are already forgiven, and there is nothing left to do except to celebrate our forgiveness. But again, Scripture is clear that before the "corporate forgiveness" worked out on the cross can be individually appropriated, the sinner must see his/her sinfulness in the light of the Cross, be broken in heartfelt repentance and contrition, make confession, and by faith claim the benefits of the atonement for herself personally.

All of this, of course, is the gift of Christ through the operation of the Spirit, and not at all a work generated by sinful humans. Repentance and faith are as much a gift as forgiveness.³⁹ This process is spelled out forcefully in the Penitential Psalms, 32 and

51, and in the chapters in *Steps to Christ* on "Repentance and Confession," and "Faith and Acceptance."⁴⁰ A powerful summary is found in *Selected Messages*:

The first step toward salvation is to respond to the drawing of the love of Christ. God sends message after message to men, entreating them to repentance, that He may forgive, and write pardon against their names. Shall there be no repentance? Shall His appeals be unheeded? Shall His overtures of mercy be ignored, and His love utterly rejected? Oh, then man will cut himself off from the medium through which he may gain life eternal; for God only pardons the penitent! By the manifestation of His love, by the entreating of His Spirit, He woos men to repentance; for repentance is the gift of God, and whom He pardons He first makes penitent. . . .

Christ came to reveal to the sinner the justice and love of God, that He might give repentance to Israel and remission of sins. When the sinner beholds Jesus lifted upon the cross, suffering the guilt of the transgressor, bearing the penalty of sin; when he beholds God's abhorrence of evil in the fearful manifestation of the death of the cross, and His love for fallen man, he is led to repentance toward God because of his transgression of the law which is holy, and just, and good. He exercises faith in Christ, because the divine Saviour has become his substitute, his surety, and advocate, the one in whom his very life is centered. To the repenting sinner God can show His mercy and truth, and bestow upon him His forgiveness and love."⁴¹

In this passage from inspiration we find an emphasis upon the basis of salvation in the substitutionary work of Christ, satisfying divine justice; and we find the path of forgiveness on the part of man beautifully encapsulated. We also see the eagerness with which God longs to forgive man. In fact the same passage goes on to say:

Though all heaven has been poured out in one rich gift—for when God gave His Son, He gave the choicest gift of heaven, and the treasures of heaven are at our command—yet to the repenting soul the enemy will seek to represent God as stern and inexorable, unwilling to pardon the transgressor. At different times letters have come to me from persons who were in despair over their sins. One and another have written: 'I fear I am past all help. Is there any hope for me?' To these poor souls the message has been given: 'Hope in God. The Father has bread enough and to spare. Arise, and go to your

Father. He will meet you a great way off. He will give you His love and compassion.⁴²

What a precious truth! And this leads us to the third facet of forgiveness:

The Full Assurance of Forgiveness

The apostolic assurance is: "If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just to forgive us our sins, and to cleanse us from all unrighteousness" (1 John 1:9, KJV). Ellen White elaborates:

He [Jesus] lived a sinless life. He died for us, and now he offers to take our sins and give us his righteousness. If you give yourself to him, and accept him as your Saviour, then, sinful as your life may have been, for his sake you are accounted righteous. Christ's character stands in place of your character, and you are accepted before God just as if you had not sinned.⁴³

What glorious promises! But, as E. G. White reminds us in *Steps to Christ*, the chapter on "Faith and Acceptance,"

Here is where thousands fail; they do not believe that Jesus pardons them personally, individually. They do not take God at His word. It is the privilege of all who comply with the conditions to know for themselves that pardon is freely extended for every sin. Put away the suspicion that God's promises are not meant for you. They are for every repentant transgressor.⁴⁴

For the next few paragraphs, the rest of the chapter, the pen of inspiration rehearses the precious promises of God regarding forgiveness. Promises such as Isaiah 44:22—"I have blotted out, as a thick cloud, thy transgressions, and, as a cloud, thy sins." Like Ephesians 1:7—"We have redemption through his blood, the forgiveness of sins." Then she concludes the chapter, "Yes, only believe that God is your helper. . . . As you draw near to him with confession and repentance, he will draw near to you with mercy and forgiveness."⁴⁵

God wants us to know for sure that we have forgiveness of sins. He wants us to hear the same priestly pronouncement as the Old Testament sinner heard who confessed his sins over the sacrifice: "He is forgiven!" (Lev 4-5).

For most of my young life, on into my early ministry as a pastor,

I didn't have the assurance of forgiveness and acceptance. I read those statements in E. G. White's writings about not ever saying "I am saved" and thought she meant one could never have assurance of forgiveness and acceptance with God. I didn't realize at that time that she was refuting the notion of "once-saved always saved" and was not at all denying the joy of full assurance of forgiveness and acceptance.⁴⁶ Finally God led me to see the beautiful promises of forgiveness, pardon, justification, acceptance. I stepped out by faith upon those promises, and experienced what it was like to know that I was "accepted in the beloved" (Eph 1:6, KJV).

Since then I have found the divine promises of forgiveness leaping out at me from all over Scripture. And I have found E. G. White affirming the joy of forgiveness. This last week I have been looking through the CD ROM recording of all of E. G. White's published writings.⁴⁷ I was astounded to find her usage of the term forgiveness and related words. For "forgive" there are 918 entries; for "forgiven," 729; for "forgiveness," 935—a total of 2,582 entries relating to forgiveness, not to speak of the word "pardon" employed 1,590 times and "justification/justify/justified," 1,560 times.

What has especially delighted me was to find so many references to the joy of forgiveness—such phrases as "[David felt] the rapture of the assurance of forgiveness"⁴⁸; or "the sweet evidence of the forgiveness of sin."⁴⁹

Have you experienced that rapture, that sweet evidence? It is only a prayer away!

The Fruit of Forgiveness: A Life of Obedience and Holiness

Now we come to the final facet of forgiveness that we consider this eve of Passover (1992). The fruit of forgiveness. Again, we find this facet illustrated in the first Passover. Once more, we draw from the description in *Patriarchs and Prophets*. After depicting the symbolism of the lamb prepared whole—not a bone of the Lamb of God was to be broken, and the completeness of Christ's sacrifice—E. G. White writes: "The flesh was to be eaten. It is not enough even that we believe on Christ for the forgiveness of sin; we must by faith be constantly receiving spiritual strength and nourishment from him through his word."⁵⁰ Then in concluding remarks on the Passover service, we find this:

By obedience the people were to give evidence of their faith. So all who hope to be saved by the merits of the blood of Christ should realize that they themselves have something to do in securing their salvation. While it is Christ only that can redeem us from the penalty of transgression, we are to turn from sin to obedience. Man is saved by faith, not by works; yet his faith must be shown by his works. God has given His Son to die as a propitiation for sin, he has manifested the light of truth, the way of life, he has given facilities, ordinances, and privileges; and now man must cooperate with these saving agencies; he must appreciate and use the helps that God has provided—believe and obey all the divine requirements.⁵¹

The emphasis upon the fruit of forgiveness in a forgiving spirit is apparent in Jesus' discussion in the Sermon on the Mount (Matt 6:12-15) and again in the parable of the unforgiving servant (Matt 18:21-35).⁵² John presents this balance between root and fruit: "If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just to *forgive* us our sins and to *cleanse* us from all unrighteousness" (1 John 1:9, KJV).

Once again, Ellen White is right on target in pointing out that forgiveness is not merely a detached legal pronouncement of pardon without any connection to our ethical behavior, as some have claimed. "Forgiveness has a broader meaning than many suppose. . . . God's forgiveness is not merely a judicial act by which He sets us free from condemnation. It is not only forgiveness *for* sin, but reclaiming *from* sin. It is the outflow of redeeming love that transforms the heart."⁵³

Conclusion

This afternoon we have explored four facets of forgiveness. If you like rhyme, we could call them: (1) the *foundation* of forgiveness; (2) the *appropriation* of forgiveness; (3) the *jubilation* of forgiveness; and (4) the *attestation* of forgiveness.

We have seen how each facet at times has been distorted within Christendom (and within Adventism) by emphasizing one point to the exclusion of the others.

Just now, I invite you to renew your dedication to *tota Scriptura*—to all that Scripture affirms about forgiveness. This Passover eve/Easter Friday—let us grasp the balanced, wholistic picture of salvation and forgiveness:

1. Let us embrace the *foundation* of forgiveness in our Substitute, Jesus Christ, who by His propitiatory death satisfied retributive justice in our behalf.

2. Let us reach out by faith in *appropriation* of this wonderful gift of forgiveness, pardon, justification.

3. Let us daily, hourly, know the *jubilation*, the rapture of the assurance of forgiveness.

4. And let us give *attestation* to the reality of our forgiveness by allowing the Savior not only judicially to pardon our guilt, but also to reclaim us from sin.

Endnotes

1 See Ellen G. White, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 372.

2 In Ps 85:2 "forgive" (*nāšā'*) and "pardon" (*kāsāh*) are used in parallel: "Thou didst forgive the iniquity of thy people; thou didst pardon all their sin." In Rom 4:6-7 (citing Ps 32:1-2), Paul virtually equates "forgive" and "justify." Quotations from RSV unless otherwise noted.

3 *Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary*, 6:1070 (MS 21, 1891). Italics supplied.

4 The basic lexical information is largely adapted from R. K. Harrison, "Forgiveness," *International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*, 2:340. Hereafter cited as *ISBE*.

5 *Ibid.* See also the forthcoming Andrews University Ph.D. dissertation on *nāšā'* by Gudmundur Olafsson.

6 White, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 274.

7 *Ibid.*, p. 277.

8 Lev 4:20, 26, 31, 35; 5:10, 13, 16; 6:7.

9 Angel Rodriguez, *Substitution in the Old Testament Cultus*, Andrews University Seminary Doctoral Dissertation Series, vol. 3 (Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University Press, 1982).

10 Ellen G. White, *Seventh-day Adventists Answer Questions on Doctrine* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing Assoc., 1957), p. 678 (= *ST*, March 14, 1878). Hereafter cited as *QD*.

11 Jack Provonsha, *You Can Go Home Again* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing Assoc., 1982), p. 104. "He [Christ] is a substitute, then, from our perspective, not from God's."

12 E.g., Exod 21:22-25; Lev 24:19, 20; Deut 19:15-21.

13 E.g., Isa 3:11; 40:2; Jer 16:18; 50:15; Ezek 7:27; Obad 15.

14 E.g., Ps 137:8.

15 E.g., Matt 7:1-2.

16 E.g., Rom 2:1-2; 14:10; 2 Thess 1:6-9; Col 3:25; Heb 2:2-3.

17 E.g., Rev 6:9-11; 16:5-7; 18:6-8, 20. Meredith Kline, "Double Trouble," *JETS* 32 (1989): 171-179, has shown that the words translated as "double" in Rev 18:6; Jer 16:18; Isa 40:2; etc., actually mean "equivalent."

18 E.g., Provonsha, p. 58: "Jesus Himself repudiated the principle [of *lex talionis*]."

19 See, e.g., J. H. Gerstner, "Law in the New Testament," *ISBE*, 3:87; John R. W. Stott, *The Message of the Sermon on the Mount (Matthew 5-7): Christian Counter-Culture* (Downers Grove, IL: Inter-Varsity Press, 1978), pp. 103-105.

20 *QD*, p. 667 = MS 35, 1895. *Pace* Provonsha, pp. 36, 55-58.

21 See, e.g., Provonsha, pp. 86-87.

22 *QD*, p. 672 = *ST*, May 30, 1895.

23 *SDABC*, 7:912-913; cf. *QD*, p. 683-684 = MS 29, 1906.

24 A. Graham Maxwell, *Can God Be Trusted?* (Nashville, TN: Southern Publishing Assoc., 1977), pp. 87-88.

25 *QD*, p. 679 = MS 50, 1900.

26 *SDABC*, 6:1070 = MS 21, 1891.

27 Ellen G. White, *Desire of Ages*, p. 756.

28 E.g., Provonsha, pp. 87-88.

29 *QD*, p. 674 = MS 50, 1900. See also *QD*, pp. 673-674, for other similar statements.

30 Ellen G. White, *The Upward Look*, p. 219 = Letter 85, July 24, 1886.

31 In his article on "Forgiveness" in the *ISBE*, 2:343.

32 See the paper by Jo Ann Davidson on "Atonement and the Writings of Ellen White," forthcoming in *JATS*. Ellen White never "matures" to a different view.

33 *QD*, p. 674 = *General Conference Bulletin*, 4th Quarter, 1899, vol. 3, p. 102.

34 See Provonsha, p. 36.

35 White, *The Upward Look*, p. 219: "Justice asked for the sufferings of a man. Christ, equal with God, gave the sufferings of a God. It was for man—all for man . . ."

36 *QD*, p. 666 = MS 84a, 1897.

37 White, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 277. Italics supplied.

38 See Lev 4:15, 24, 29, for the reference to laying on of hands; and Lev 5:5 refers to confession; Lev 16 and 23 emphasize the aspect of repentance—affliction of soul in connection with the Day of Atonement; see also Ezek 18:30; and especially note 1 Kgs 8:47, 50—"If they repent . . . then . . . forgive."

39 See Acts 5:31; Rom 12:3.

40 See especially Ellen G. White, *Steps to Christ*, pp. 26, 55. See also 2 Cor 7:10; Luke 3:3.

41 Ellen G. White, *Selected Messages*, 1:323-324.

42 *Ibid.*, 1:324-325. The forthcoming Andrews University Ph.D. dissertation by Gudmundur Olafsson, examines a key Old Testament word for forgiveness (*nāsā*), and shows how *nāsā* in the context of forgiveness also implies the supportive relationship, the personal care and loving concern of God, His willingness to take on Himself the consequences of sin, to suffer, even die (pp. 301-303 in present draft).

43 White, *Steps to Christ*, p. 62.

44 *Ibid.*, pp. 52-53.

45 *Ibid.*, p. 55.

46 For further discussion of the Ellen White statements and my own experience, see "The Good News of Yom Kippur," *JATS* 2 (1991):8-9.

47 Ellen G. White, *The Published Ellen G. White Writings on Compact Disc* (Silver Spring, MD: Ellen G. White Estate, Inc., 1990).

48 *SDABC*, 3:1146.

49 Ellen G. White, *Faith and Works*, p. 16. Italics supplied.

50 Ellen G. White, *Patriarchs and Prophets*, p. 277.

51 *Ibid.*, p. 279.

52 E. G. White comments: "We are not forgiven *because* we forgive, but *as* we forgive. The ground of all forgiveness is found in the unmerited love of God, but by our attitude toward others we show whether we have made that love our own," *Christ's Objects Lessons*, p. 251. Italics hers.

53 Ellen G. White, *Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing*, p. 114. Italics hers.